

BARNSLEY METROPOLITAN BOROUGH COUNCIL

Report of Senior Conservation Officer, Planning Policy to Planning Regulatory Board May 2020

Proposed adoption of the Draft Local List of Buildings and Sites (Elsecar)

1.0 Purpose of Report

- 1.1 To consider the adoption of the draft local list of buildings (structures and sites) in Elsecar.
- 1.2 To consider the approval of future additions to the adopted local list beyond Elsecar in order to widen the local list out to the entire Borough.

2.0 Recommendations

- (i) **That, in relation to the requirements of Local Plan Policies HE1 ((e) Heritage), HE3 (Developments Affecting Historic Buildings) and HE5 (The Demolition of Historic Buildings), the Council adopts the draft local list for Elsecar.**
- (ii) **Furthermore, in relation to the above Local Plan Policies, the Council approves future additions to the local list to widen this initial list beyond Elsecar to cover the rest of the Borough (subject to the amendment of selection criteria that are currently Elsecar specific) .**

3.0 Background and Proposal

3.1 Barnsley Council and Historic England are currently in the final (third) year of delivery of the Elsecar Heritage Action Zone (HAZ). The project was formed as a partnership between Barnsley Metropolitan District Council and Historic England with an aim of researching and safeguarding the rich industrial heritage of the village whilst guiding future developments. Much work has already taken place with the local community to uncover and celebrate the often hidden, history and archaeology of the village. The project is also in the process of helping to realise the village's potential as part of the region's growing visitor and tourism economy through the conservation and re-use of historic buildings. Following (and in support of) this, several planning related documents have been produced or proposed. This includes the Elsecar Conservation Area Design and Maintenance Guide (now an adopted Supplementary Planning Document), a good practice maintenance leaflet for historic buildings in Elsecar, and a conservation area appraisal. Following the recent production (by Historic England) of a detailed Historic Area Assessment of the HAZ area, and in discussion with residents, a local list of buildings, structures or sites of local heritage merit is now proposed.

Local Listing

Local lists identify buildings, structures or archaeological sites (heritage assets) that have a demonstrable local architectural or social significance. However, assets on a local list are non-designated as opposed to designated national listings - commonly referred to as Listed Buildings. National listings have national heritage significance and are protected by heritage legislation found within the Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas Act 1990. Local listing is not covered by the Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas Act and so provides a lower order of heritage protection which is non-statutory. However, the status of a locally listed heritage asset is a material consideration wherever planning permission is required. As a result, various provisions of the National Planning Policy Framework, and Barnsley Local Plan heritage policies come into effect. For example:

‘...developments which will help in the management, conservation, understanding and enjoyment of Barnsley’s historic environment...which conserve and enhance the significance and setting of the borough’s heritage assets,.....will be achieved by supporting proposals which conserve Barnsley’s non-designated heritage assets.

(Barnsley Local Plan Policy HE1)

Furthermore, proposals affecting heritage assets including:

‘..buildings of evident historic significance such as locally listed buildings (or their setting) should seek to conserve and where appropriate enhance that building’s significance.

(Barnsley Local Plan Policy HE3)

4.0 Statutory Criteria, Selection, Consultation

There are no statutory criteria for the drawing up, adoption, and operation of a local list. However, recognised good practice dictates that there should be robust but logical selection criteria for the addition of buildings or sites onto the list. Moreover, good consultation with building / site owners, local residents and relevant stakeholders is key to the adoption, success, and operation of the list.

Selection criteria were established with the assistance of Historic England based on national selection criteria but with a local focus. Candidates for the local list were evaluated based on their age, rarity, architectural and historical importance, social and community value and group and townscape merit. Each building or site received a score from each evaluation section, requiring a total score of 24 or more (of a possible 43) to make it onto the list. Full details of the selection criteria can be found at Appendix A.

Consultation on possible candidates for the draft Elsecar local list was carried out with residents during the Summer and Autumn of 2019. Four drop-in events took place where residents were invited to suggest candidates and had the opportunity to put questions to Council Officers about what the local list means and how it would

work in practice. Following this, scoring and selection to the draft list took place. A letter has also been dispatched directly to properties selected for the draft list explaining the proposal, what local listing means, and who to contact for further information.

5.0 Options

5.1 The Council approves the adoption of the Elsecar Draft Local List and approves this list to be expanded to the rest of the Borough in due course.

5.2 The Council could decline to adopt the draft local list. However, evidence from the Historic Area Assessment (provided by Historic England), the use of robust selection criteria, public support, and the risk of reputational damage with Historic England (who advocate local listing) means this is not the Officer recommendation.

6.0 Local Area Implications

6.1 There are no implications for the local area beyond the adoption of the draft local list which would assist planning decision making. Those individuals directly affected by adoption of the draft list have been contacted directly and no objections have been received.

7.0 Compatibility with European Convention on Human Rights

7.1 These proposals are considered compatible with the Convention.

8.0 Ensuring Social Inclusion

8.1 These proposals will have no negative impact on social inclusion.

9.0 Reduction of Crime and Disorder

9.1 These proposals are not considered to have any effect on crime and disorder.

10.0 Financial Implications

10.1 These proposals are considered to have no financial implications.

11.0 Risk Assessment

11.1 The compilation of a local list of buildings or structures is non-statutory in nature and so adoption will not compromise relevant legislation. The result of inclusion of a building on a local list is limited to its consideration whenever Planning Permission is sought in respect of that building. However, no objections have been received to this proposal. Should objections be received with regards to future additions to the list, these will be carefully taken into consideration before inclusion.

12.0 Consultations

12.1 Residents, local stakeholders, Ward Councillors, and other Council departments have been consulted on the proposals. No objections have been received.

13.0 Proposal

13.1 Councillors approve the recommendations in section 2.

14.0 Appendices

Appendix A – Selection Criteria

Elsecar Local List – scoring criteria for local list inclusion

Age, fabric and rarity – Usually a building should be over 30 years of age to be included on the Local List.

Age: When was the building/structure made? NB buildings/sites that score 1 or 0 are unlikely to be included on the list, unless in exceptional circumstances (e.g. a site with architectural merit and high community value)

5 – Before 1795 (pre-industrial Elsecar)

4 - 1795-1849 (early development – north end of the village)

3 – 1850 – 1902 (later development – south end of the village)

2 – 1902 - 1947 (twentieth century, up to the nationalisation of the coal industry)

1 – 1947 – current date (after the Fitzwilliam influence) no less than 30 years old

0 – less than 30 years old

Survival of historic fabric: Historic fabric refers to the materials that the building is made of, e.g. the walls/frame, windows, doors, roof. Historic fabric can be multi-phase, but each phase should be readable. Buildings that score 2 or below in this category are unlikely to be added to the local list.

5– high survival of historic fabric, including some internal features (e.g. original doors, plasterwork details, floor coverings).

4- high survival of external historic fabric, including windows, doors, roof covering, chimneys and chimney pots and other architectural features, but with low or no survival of internal features.

3– most of the external historic fabric survives, but some smaller elements have been replaced – most often this will be the windows, doors and chimneys. Or some elements have undergone faithful restoration (e.g. stonework replaced, but with original detailing recreated).

2– historic envelope survives but moderate to high percentage of original materials have been changed, e.g. non-original roof coverings, windows and doors. Or there have been major alterations to the original building design, making the intended form and function less readable – e.g. the building has been extended, historic windows/openings altered etc.

1 – low survival of historic fabric, including heavy restoration where the work has not been done faithfully to the original (where this is known, or can be assumed)
0 – very little historic fabric survives, or where it does it has been extended and altered beyond recognition

Rarity: Can apply to form or function/intended function (use whichever scores highest). This is assessed on a local/regional scale, as nationally rare structures should be protected through national listing. For archaeological sites rarity applies to the main archaeological remains, not the current use of the site. For sites where you would only ever expect one or two examples per area (e.g. cricketclub or cinema) rarity should be judged on numbers surviving across the wider borough and whether the Elsecar example is a particularly rare survival in comparison to others, e.g. is it a particularly early or well-preserved example? If not, then a score of 2 or 3 should be given.

5 – The only one of its kind in Elsecar/Barnsley Borough (or very rare in the rest of Barnsley Borough).

4 - The only one of its kind in Elsecar. Other examples found elsewhere in Barnsley borough.

3 – One of a handful of buildings/structures/sites of similar historic function/design in Elsecar. Uncommon in the rest of the borough.

2 - One of a handful of buildings/structures of similar historic function/design/sites in Elsecar. Common elsewhere in the borough.

1 - One of many buildings/structures of similar function/design in Elsecar. Uncommon elsewhere in the borough

0 – One of many buildings/structures of similar function/design in Elsecar and common elsewhere in the borough

Group value: Usually applies to physical form/association, not historical association (which has a separate category – see below)

5 - Associated with a nationally designated structure (listed building or SAM) – e.g. part of a group of buildings of similar age or appearance, or intended to be part of a group, of which a number of buildings survive, and that includes a nationally designated site or structure. Makes a positive aesthetic contribution to the group.

4 - Associated with a number of buildings (2 or more) of similar age or appearance or intended to be part of a group of which 2 or more buildings survive, but none are listed or scheduled. Makes a positive aesthetic contribution to the group.

3 – Associated with a number of buildings (2 or more) that have townscape merit as a group, but not necessarily of similar age or appearance. Not necessarily built as (or intended to be) part of a group, but nevertheless make a positive visual contribution to the landscape or streetscape as part of a group now (e.g. as part of a historic high street).

2 – Associated with a large number of buildings of different ages and/or appearance spread across a wider area that together tell an important story (or provide important evidence) about the development of a place or institution

1 – Associated with a small number of buildings of different ages and/or appearance spread across a wider area that together tell an important story (or provide important evidence) about the development of a place or institution

0 – Not part of a group

Aesthetic/Architectural contribution:

- 5 - Highly designed, aesthetic interest, associated with a known architect/designer
- 4 - Highly designed, aesthetic interest, not associated with a known architect/designer
- 3 - Typical of local vernacular, part of a known type or style of vernacular building (e.g. cruck barn) with original/historic features fully or mainly surviving. Or, intentional design with some strong decorative architectural features – e.g. string courses, basic decoration to windows/doors etc. Or readable historic function – e.g. former shop window.
- 2 - Less typical of local vernacular. Or typical of local vernacular but with fewer decorative architectural features, or moderate alterations.
- 1 - Minor local stylistic interest – some vernacular features surviving/visible. Or typical of local vernacular/readable historic function, but with heavy alterations.
- 0 - Makes no aesthetic contribution – standard design, functional, no decorative features

Archaeological interest:

- 4 - Archaeological features known to survive, with high potential to explain previous site uses and processes
- 3 - Archaeological features known to survive, with less potential to explain previous site uses and processes
- 2 - High potential for archaeology to survive
- 1 – Low potential for archaeology to survive
- 0 – Archaeology known not to survive

Historic Association: this can apply to objects/structures as well as buildings and sites.

- 4 – Associated with a known nationally significant historic figure or organisation, building/structure, or event (with documentary or other evidence)
- 3 - Associated with a known locally significant historic figure or organisation, building/structure (e.g. post office, shop etc), or event (with documentary or other evidence)
- 2 – Thought to be associated with a known nationally significant figure or organisation, building/structure, or event (no evidence)
- 1 – Thought to be associated with a known locally significant figure or organisation, building/structure, or event (no evidence)
- 0 – No association with a historic person, building/structure, or event

Communal/Social:

- 5 – High communal value – historic structure (pre 1947) built for the local community, or by the local community (e.g. funded through public subscription). And/or the whole building/structure is associated with large number of shared local stories and collective experiences, e.g. a band stand, cricket pavilion, local pub). Has potential for continued/future use to benefit the local community. Highly valued by the local community.

- 4 – Moderate communal value – the whole building/structure is associated with a range of shared local stories and more personal/individual experiences. Valued by some of the local community. Has potential for continued/future use to benefit the local community (even if this is a creative use and not its original/intended use)
- 3 – Some elements of the building currently have communal value – e.g. old advertisements, historic graffiti or signage connected with shared local stories, or people who are/were well-known locally. Potential for continued/future use to benefit the local community
- 2 – Whole building/structure currently has high or moderate communal value (as above), but with little or no potential for continued/future use to benefit the local community
- 1 – Some elements of the building currently have communal value/shared social history, but with little or no potential for continued/future use to benefit the local community
- 0 – Not used or valued by the local community

Townscape/Landscape Merit – this can apply to the whole building/structure or to key elements of that structure, where these are visible and make a specific contribution to the special character of an area

- 5 – Currently makes a strong contribution to the townscape or wider landscape – contributes to the special historic character of the area, or is located in a prominent position, or is part of an important view or vista
- 4 – Has the potential to make a strong contribution to the townscape or wider landscape if it was repaired/in better condition/better presented, including removal of immediate modern boundaries – e.g. trees/walls/fences - where these currently obscure views of the site/building
- 3 – Makes a moderate contribution to the townscape or wider landscape – contributes to the special character of an area, but is located in a less prominent location
- 2 – Has the potential to make a moderate contribution to the townscape or wider landscape if it was repaired/in better condition/better presented
- 1 – Makes a minor contribution to the townscape or wider landscape
- 0 – Makes no, or a negative, contribution to the townscape or wider landscape

Appendix B – Elsecar Local List and Scoring

	Age	Fabric	Rarity	Group	Aesthetic	Archaeological	Historic association	Communal/social	Townscape / landscape	Total
ELSECAR LOCAL LIST										
<i>Total possible score</i>	5	5	5	5	5	4	4	5	5	43
Asset Name										
<i>Housing</i>										
Meadow Row	4	3	3	5	3	1	4	2	4	29
Hemingfield Pit Row Cottages	4	2	3	5	3	2	4	0	4	27
Elsecar gasworks managers house	3	3	4	5	3	4	4	2	4	32
Former shops next to Market Pub (4-6 Wentworth Road)	3	3	2	4	1	1	5	2	4	25
79-85 Fitzwilliam Street (John Carr style houses)	3	3	3	5	3	0	4	1	4	26
House at the back of Fitzwilliam Street (behind the hairdressers) facing towards the ironworks	4	4	3	4	3	1	2	0	3	24
88-94 Fitzwilliam Street (next to Milton Hall)	4	3	3	4	2	1	4	0	5	26
Former rectory (Armroyd Lane)	3	4	4	2	4	1	4	1	4	27
4-14 Fitzwilliam Street (including outbuildings to rear)	3	3	1	5	3	1	4	1	5	26
31 Hill Street (former Royal Oak pub)	3	3	3	4	3	2	0	4	4	26
39 Hill Street	3	4	3	4	4	1	0	0	5	24
Footrill Cottage (Broadcarr Road) – see also below	4	3	3	3	3	4	4	1	3	28
Milton House – including garden	4	5	3	4	4	4	4	1	5	34
<i>Leisure</i>										
Elsecar Park Bandstand	2	5	4	4	5	1	3	5	5	34
<i>Other</i>										
Fingerpost (Wath Road)	2	5	4	0	4	0	4	2	4	25
Broadcarr Road Footrill	4	3	3	5	4	4	4	0	2	29
Elsecar Reservoir	4	1	2	0	0	4	4	5	4	24
<i>Pubs</i>										
Market Pub	3	3	3	4	3	2	4	5	4	31

Milton Arms	4	2	3	5	2	2	3	5	4	30
Crown Inn	4	2	3	3	3	1	3	5	4	28
Former Clothiers Arms	3	3	1	3	3	1	3	4	4	25

Industry

Elsecar Main Ambulance Store	2	4	5	1	1	2	4	4	4	27
Elsecar gasworks, site of former gasholders (see also managers house above)	3	0	4	5	0	4	4	0	4	24
Milton ironworks	4	0	5	5	0	4	4	3	3	28
Waggonway	4		4	5	0	4	4	5	4	30

Officer Contact: Tony Wiles Tel: ext 2576
Date: 6th May 2020